

COULD THE PROPHET EVER HAVE TRULY SAID THAT A
MAN WHO TORTURED WOMEN, FLED BATTLES, AND
STRUCK HIS OWN WIFE WOULD HAVE BEEN A
PROPHET AFTER HIM IF THERE WAS ANY?

UMAR AND THE PROPHETIC BENCHMARK

A RESEARCH BASED ANALYSIS



BY ALKARBALA.ORG

Table of Content

<u>Introduction</u>	<u>3</u>
<u>Chapter One: The Claim of Umar's Prophethood</u>	<u>4</u>
<u>Chapter Two: Ibrahim prayed for children as a mercy, Umar killed his as cruelty.....</u>	<u>7</u>
<u>Umar's Cruelty to His Own Daughter.....</u>	<u>8</u>
<u>Chapter Three: Prophet Mūsā (ؑ) Faced Fir'awn, and 'Umar Feared Nothingness.....</u>	<u>11</u>
<u>Chapter Four: Prophet Isā (ؑ) Was a Mercy From the Cradle — Umar Was a Tyrant From Jahiliyya.....</u>	<u>13</u>
<u>Chapter Five: Prophet Dāwūd(ؑ) was the Giant-Slayer — 'Umar was the Battle-Fleer.....</u>	<u>16</u>
<u>Chapter Six: The Prophet Muhammad(saws) Never Raised His Hand on his wives — Umar use to beat his wife.....</u>	<u>22</u>
<u>Conclusion:</u>	<u>23</u>

Introduction

Among the many fabricated and exaggerated merits attributed to ‘Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb in Sunni literature, one stands out as their crown jewel: the narration found in Tirmidhi where the Prophet ﷺ is alleged to have said, *“If there were to be a prophet after me, it would have been ‘Umar.”*

This single line has become a banner for many today who flaunt it across pulpits, lectures, and social media platforms in a desperate attempt to inflate the stature of their second caliph and mock the followers of Ahlulbayt (ع). The irony, however, is striking. If we were to accept this narration at face value — for the sake of argument — then the implications are far greater than its propagators realize. It would necessitate that ‘Umar possessed the prophetic virtues described in the Qur'an — truthfulness, patience, mercy, justice, compassion, chastity, wisdom, and humility.

Every prophet mentioned in the Qur'an is praised primarily for his **character**: Ibrahim (ع) was forbearing and truthful; Musa (ع) was sincere and chosen; Isa (ع) was blessed and dutiful; Yusuf (ع) was chaste, forgiving, and patient; Ayub (ع) was steadfast in trials; and Muhammad ﷺ was the very embodiment of mercy and the best of character. This is the divine **benchmark of prophethood**.

The question this book poses is simple: *Did ‘Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb’s character ever reflect this prophetic standard?* Or, when weighed against the Qur'anic scale of prophethood, does he collapse under the weight of his own actions? From his days of burying his daughter alive, to his violent opposition to Islam, to his repeated humiliations of women — including the wives of the Prophet ﷺ — to his notorious cowardice in battle, and to his atrocious conduct after the death of the Prophet ﷺ, we will examine the reality of Umar ibn al-Khattab through the very Sunni sources that claim his greatness.

This work is a direct and unapologetic Shia response to a false claim that has long been used as a weapon against the followers of the Ahlulbayt (ع).

Chapter One: The Claim of Umar's Prophethood

Among the many narrations attributed to Umar ibn al-Khattab in Sunni tradition, one has achieved particular fame and notoriety. It is reported in *Jāmi‘ al-Tirmidhī* that the Prophet ﷺ allegedly said:

لَوْ كَانَ بَعْدِي نَبِيًّا لَكَانَ عُمَرَ بْنُ الْخَطَّابِ

“If there were to be a prophet after me, it would have been Umar ibn al-Khattab.”

This narration, disputed in authenticity even by Sunni scholars themselves, has nonetheless become a rallying cry for those who seek to elevate Umar's stature beyond measure. In our time, it circulates widely on pulpits, in lectures, and across social media platforms, often accompanied by mockery towards the Shia, as though it were an undeniable proof of Umar's superiority.

But let us pause and reflect. Let us, for the sake of argument, assume that this narration is true. What would it actually imply? It would mean that Umar ibn al-Khattab was so exemplary in character that, had the seal of prophethood not already been finalized with Muhammad ﷺ, he would have been the one chosen by Allah for that sacred station. In other words, the narration itself demands that Umar possessed the essential **virtues of prophethood**.

Here, however, arises the crucial question: **what is the benchmark of prophethood?**

The answer lies not in partisan claims, not in fabricated stories of “fadha’il,” but in the Qur'an itself. Allah has not left mankind without a clear measure of His prophets. The Qur'an repeatedly presents the prophets not merely as leaders, but as paragons of **character**, each of them defined by virtues that stand out as timeless examples.

When the Qur'an speaks of Ibrahim (ع), it does not praise him for political power or military might. Instead, it says: *“Indeed, Ibrahim was forbearing, tender-hearted, and ever turning to Allah.”* (11:75). When the Qur'an introduces Musa (ع), it highlights his sincerity: *“And mention in the Book, Musa. Indeed, he was chosen, sincere, and a messenger, a prophet.”* (19:51). Isma‘il (ع) is praised for truthfulness to his promise (19:54).

Yusuf (ع) shines in the Qur'an for his chastity when tempted, for his patience in prison, and for his forgiveness when given power over his brothers (12:24, 12:92). Isa (ع) is described as "blessed wherever he may be, dutiful to his mother, and not arrogant or rebellious" (19:31–32). Yahya (ع) is praised as "tender, pure, and dutiful to his parents" (19:13–14). Ayub (ع), tested with unimaginable trials, is remembered by Allah as "*a patient servant, excellent indeed, ever turning back to Allah.*" (38:44).

Above them all stands Muhammad ﷺ, the Seal of Prophets, described by Allah in the simplest yet most powerful terms: "*And indeed, you are upon a great moral character.*" (68:4). The Messenger ﷺ is further described as gentle, merciful, and compassionate towards the believers (3:159, 9:128).

In all these examples, the standard is clear: **prophethood is measured by character.** Prophets are chosen not merely for their abilities, but because they embody truthfulness, patience, compassion, humility, and justice. These are the divine benchmarks that Allah Himself has set forth in His Book.

If we were to accept the Tirmidhi narration about Umar, then it necessarily follows that Umar must have reflected these Qur'anic prophetic virtues. He must have been patient like Ayub, chaste like Yusuf, forgiving like Isa, truthful like Isma'il, humble like Musa, forbearing like Ibrahim, and merciful like Muhammad ﷺ. Anything less would render the narration hollow, for a man unworthy of these traits cannot be placed on the same scale as the prophets of Allah.

But this is precisely where the claim collapses. For when we examine Umar's life not through Shia polemics, but through the very Sunni sources that preserved his biography we find not prophetic mercy, but harshness; not humility, but arrogance; not patience, but impulsive anger; not compassion, but cruelty. The historical record of Umar ibn al-Khattab is one riddled with contradictions to the Qur'anic standard of prophethood.

The Qur'an is consistent: every prophet is remembered for character, not brutality. Yet Umar is remembered, even in Sunni works, for burying his daughter alive, for beating women, for fleeing from battlefields, for arguing with the Messenger ﷺ, and for spreading fear rather than mercy. How can such a man, whose actions repeatedly contradicted the Qur'anic measure of virtue, be seriously considered "worthy of prophethood"?

The truth is clear. The narration is not only weak in its chain, it is impossible in its meaning. It stands as one of the many "phantom merits" of Umar, invented and propagated to artificially elevate his status. But once the Qur'an is placed as the yardstick, the narration shatters instantly.

In this opening chapter, we have established a simple yet undeniable truth: the Qur'an itself provides the **prophetic benchmark**. Any claim that someone could be a prophet after Muhammad ﷺ must be tested against this Qur'anic scale. And by that divine standard, Umar ibn al-Khattab does not merely fall short; he stands in stark opposition.

The narration, far from elevating Umar, exposes him. For if it were true, then it would demand prophetic character from a man whose history shows anything but.

In the next chapter, we will move from theory to reality. We will look closely at the life of Umar ibn al-Khattab himself, beginning with his pre-Islamic days, and measure his conduct against the prophetic benchmark revealed in the Qur'an.

Chapter Two: Ibrahim prayed for children as a mercy, Umar killed his as cruelty.

When Allah (سبحانه وتعالى) presents the legacy of His Prophets in the Qur'an, He presents them as **standards of mercy, patience, and compassion**. Among them, Prophet Ibrahim (عليه السلام), the *Khalil of Allah*, stands as a model of *rahmah* in parenthood, yearning for righteous offspring who would carry the banner of monotheism after him.

In the Qur'an, Ibrahim (ع) is shown constantly praying for children, not as a matter of worldly pride, but as a *trust from Allah* through whom the divine message would continue. He supplicates:

"رَبَّ هَبْ لِي مِنَ الصَّالِحِينَ"

"My Lord, grant me [a child] from among the righteous." (Surah As-Saffat 37:100)

And when Allah grants him Isma'il (عليه السلام) and later Ishaq (عليه السلام), Ibrahim rejoices, nurturing them with care and raising them as believers. The Qur'an testifies to his role as a *compassionate father*:

"الْحَمْدُ لِلَّهِ الَّذِي وَهَبَ لِي عَلَى الْكِبَرِ إِسْمَاعِيلَ وَإِسْحَاقَ إِنَّ رَبِّي لَسَمِيعُ الدُّعَاءِ"

"All praise is due to Allah, Who granted me Ishmael and Isaac in my old age. Surely my Lord is the Hearer of prayers." (Surah Ibrahim 14:39)

This is the prophetic standard of fatherhood — **mercy, prayer, and protection** for one's child.

Umar's Cruelty to His Own Daughter

Contrast this with the historical record of Umar ibn al-Khattab. Before Islam, he not only participated in the heinous Jahili custom of *wa'd al-banat* (burying daughters alive), but it is narrated even by Sunni historians that **Umar himself killed his own daughter with his bare hands**.

Evidence 01:

وقد جاء عن عمر رضى الله عنه قوله : أمران في الجاهلية . أحدهما : يبكيني والآخر يضحكني
أما الذي يبكيني : فقد ذهبت بابنة لى لوأدتها ، فكنت أحفر لها الحفرة وتنفس التراب عن الحيتى وهى لا
تدرى ماذا أريد لها ، فإذا تذكرت ذلك بكى .

والآخرى : كنت أصنع إنها من التمر أضعه عند رأسي يحرسني ليلا، فإذا أصبحت معانى أكلته ، فإذا تذكرت ذلك ضحكت من نفسي.

Muhammad Shanqi:

Narrated Umar ibn Al-Khattab's saying, "There were two things in Jahiliyyah, one of them makes me cry and the other one makes me laugh. The one that makes me cry; I had taken a daughter of mine to bury her alive and I was digging the hole for her while she was dusting my beard off without knowing what I am planning for her, then when I remember that I cry. And the other one is that I used to make a God of dates that I put over my head to guard me during the night, then when I woke up I a well state I would eat it, and whenever I remember that I laugh at myself.¹

Evidence 02:

النار الا في القتل العمد . وروى أن عمر رضي الله عنه قال : يا رسول الله اني وأدت في الجاهلية ؛ فقال النبي صلي الله عليه وسلم أعتق بكل موجودة رقبة . والموعدة البنت المقتولة عندما تولد ، كان أهل الجاهلية يفعلون ذلك مخافة العار والفقر ، ولأنه حيوان يضمن بالكافرة اذا قتل خطأ فوجب

Al-Nawawi:

It is narrated that Umar said, "**O Messenger of Allah (saw), I have committed female infanticide in Jahiliyyah time.**" Then the Prophet peace and prayers of Allah be upon him said, "Manumit a slave for each Maw'uda." And the Maw'uda is the killed girl at birth. The Jahiliyyah people used to do so because of their fear of shame and poverty.²

Evidence 03:

وروى عن عمر بن الخطاب أنه قال : يا رسول الله اني وأدت في الجاهلية
قال: أعتق عن كل مسؤود رقبة وذلك أن العرب في الجاهلية كانت تحفر تحت
الحامل إذا ضربها الطلاق حفيرة يسقط فيها ولدها إذا وضعته، فإن كان ذكرًا أخرجوه منها وإن كان أنثى
تركت في حفرتها وطم التراب عليها حتى تموت، وهذا قتل عمد، وقد أوجبت فيه الكفارة.

Al-Shafi'ee:

It is narrated that Umar ibn Al-Khattab said, "**O Messenger of Allah (saw), I have committed female infanticide in Jahiliyyah times.**" Then 'he' said, "Manumit a slave for each buried alive girl." Since Arabs used to dig a hole under the pregnant woman

¹ [Adwa Al-Bayan Fi Idhah Al-Qur'aan Bil Qur'aan. Vol9, P63](#)

² [Kitab Al-Majmu Sharh Al-Muhazzab Lil-Shirazi. Vol21, Pg21](#)

*whenever she had labour that the child will fall into it whenever delivered then if he was a boy they would take him out of it and if she was a girl then they would leave it and they would dump soil over her body till she dies and this is premeditated killing and expiation has been ordered for this.*³

Evidence 04:

يصدقوا أنه وأد بنا في الجاهلية على تلك الصورة البشعة التي انتقلت اليها في بعض الروايات ، وخلاصتها و انه رضى الله عنه كان جالسا مع بعض الصحابة اذ ضحك قتيلا ثم بكى . فسأله من حضر . فقال : كنا في الجاهلية تصنع صنما من العجوة فنعبده ثم نأكله وهذا سبب ضحكته . أما بكائي فلأنه كانت لى ابنة فأردت وأدتها فأخذتها معى وحفرت لها حفرة ، فصارت تنفس التراب عن (لحيتي فدفنتها حية)

Abbas Mahmud Aqqad:

He had buried a girl in Jahiliyyah times according to the abominable way that the narrations describe. In summary that he (Umar), was sitting with some of his companions and he laughed a little then he cried, therefore the present ones asked him about it then he said, "During Jahiliyyah times, we used to make an idol from dates then we would worship it then eat it, and this is the reason of my laughing. **However, my crying was because I had a daughter and I wanted to bury her alive, then I took her with me and I dug a hole for her then she started dusting my beard off and I buried her alive.**"⁴

When we place Prophet Ibrāhīm (عليه السلام) and 'Umar side by side, the contrast is not just striking — it is terrifying. Ibrāhīm (ع) stood as the father of mercy, begging Allah for children, nurturing Ismā'īl (ع) and Ishāq (ع) as proofs of divine love, and building a nation upon compassion and faith. 'Umar, on the other hand, is remembered for snatching life from his own offspring, drowning his child in the well of cruelty. One is a Prophet whose hands built the Ka'bah with his son; the other, a tyrant whose hands crushed the innocence of his son.

If this is the man some dare to measure by the "scale of Prophethood," then it is not only an insult to Prophethood but a blasphemy against mercy itself. With such a record of rage and brutality, how can one even whisper his name alongside the Khalīl of Allah?

³ [Al-Hawi Al-Kabeer. Fi Fiqh Madhab Al-Imam Shafi wa Huwa Sharh Mukhtasar AlMudhni. Vol13, Pg67](#)

⁴ [Abqariyyat Umar. Pg.222](#)

Chapter Three: Prophet Mūsā (ع) Faced Fir‘awn, and ‘Umar Feared Nothingness

What has been carefully hidden from the general public, even though it is preserved in their most authentic book *Saheeh al-Bukhari*, is the true account of Umar's so-called “acceptance of Islam.” Contrary to the fabricated tales that glorify his courage, the actual narrations expose a very different reality. Umar did not stride into Islam as a fearless warrior; rather, he remained in hiding at home, consumed with fear of death at the hands of the Mushrikeen. He did not openly embrace Islam until he sought and received the protection of one of the fiercest enemies of the Prophet ﷺ, al-‘Āṣ ibn Wā’il.

Evidence presented further in this chapter strips away the romanticized legendaries that were later invented about Umar's bravery, revealing instead a man whose Islam began under the shield of an idol-worshipper's guarantee. This fact alone is enough to collapse the mythology woven around him in Makkah and to show how far the truth has been buried beneath layers of propaganda.

Evidence 01:

٣٨٦٤ - حدثنا يحيى بن سليمان قال : حدثي ابن وهب قال: حدثي عمر بن محمد قال : فأخبرني جدي زيد بن عبد الله بن عمر عن أبيه قال : بينما هو في الدار خائفًا إذ جاءه العاص بن وائل الشهmi أبو عمر و عليه حلة جبر وقميص مكفوف بحرير - وهو من بني سهم وهم حلقونا في الجahليّة - فقال : ما بالك؟ قال: زعم قومك أنهم سيقتلونني أن أسلمت . قال : لا سبيل إليك. بعد أن قالها أمنت فخرج العاصي فلقي الناس قد سال بهم الوادي ، فقال: أين ت يريدون؟ فقالوا: نريد هذا ابن الخطاب الذي صبا. قال: لا سبيل إليه. فكر الناس الحديث ٣٨١٤ - طرفة في : (٣٨٦٥)

In Sahih al-Bukhari, Abdullah bin Umar narrates:

While Umar was at home (hiding) in a state of fear, there came Al-'As bin Wa'il As-Sahmi Abu Amr, wearing an embroidered cloak and a shirt having silk hems. He was from the tribe of Bani Sahm who were our allies during the pre-Islamic period of ignorance. **Al-'As said to Umar, "What is wrong with you?"** He said, "Your people claim that they would kill me if I become a Muslim." Al-'As said, "Nobody will harm you (I give you protection), after that I embraced Islam." So Al-'As went out and met the people streaming in the whole valley. He said, "Where are you going?" They said, "We want Ibn Al-Khattab who has embraced Islam." Al-'As said, "There is no way for anybody to touch him." So the people retreated.⁵

⁵ [Saheeh Al-Bukhari. Vol. 63. Book 35. H 3864. Pg945.](#)

Evidence 02:

٣٨٦٥ - حدثنا علي بن عبد الله حدثنا سفيان قال عمرو بن دينار : سمعته قال : قال عبد الله بن عمر رضي الله عنهما : الما أسلم عمر ، اجتمع الناس عند داره وقالوا: صباً عمر وأنا غلام فوق ظهر بيتي - فجاء رجل عليه قباء من دبياج فقال : قد صبا عمر ، فما ذاك ؟ فأنما له جار، قال: فرأيت الناس تصدعوا عنه. فقلت : من هذا؟ قالوا : العاص بن وائل

In Sahih al-Bukhari, Abdullah bin Umar narrates:

"When Umar embraced Islam, all the (disbelieving) people gathered around his home and said, "Umar has embraced Islam." At that time I was still a boy and was on the roof of my house. **There came a man wearing a cloak of Dibaj (i.e. a kind of silk), and said, "Umar has embraced Islam. Nobody can harm him for I am his protector."** I then saw the people going away from Umar and I asked who the man was, and they said, he was "Al-'As bin Wa'il." ⁶

⁶ [Saheeh Al-Bukhari, Vol. 63, Book 35, H 3864, Pg945.](#)

Chapter Four: Prophet Ḥasan (ع) Was a Mercy From the Cradle — Umar Was a Tyrant From Jahiliyya

”فَأَشَارَتْ إِلَيْهِ قَالُوا كَيْفَ كُنْتُمْ مَنْ كَانَ فِي الْمَهْدِ صَبِيًّا ۝ قَالَ إِنِّي عَبْدُ اللَّهِ أَتَانِي الْكِتَابَ وَجَعَلَنِي نَبِيًّا“

(Maryam 19:29–30)

When Maryam (ع) was accused and humiliated by her people, the infant Ḥasan (ع) spoke from the cradle to defend his mother's honor. This moment stands as one of the greatest symbols in the Qur'an of how a prophet stood for the dignity of a woman.

In sharp contrast, history records that 'Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb, instead of defending women, inflicted cruelty upon them. Reports show how he would torture slave women who had embraced Islam, beating them until exhaustion, showing no mercy nor respect for their human dignity.

Thus, while the Qur'an immortalizes the image of a newborn prophet speaking to protect a woman's chastity, the same Islamic history reveals the opposite conduct from a man whom others later elevated. This contrast itself speaks volumes.

Evidence 01:

وَمِنْ يَجَارِيَةِ بَنِي مُؤْمِنٍ - حِي مِنْ بَنِي عَدَى بْنِ كَعْبٍ - وَكَانَ عُمَرَ بْنَ الْخَطَّابَ يَعْذِبُهَا لِتَرْكِ الْإِسْلَامِ، وَهُوَ يَوْمَئِذٍ مُشْرِكٌ وَهُوَ يَضْرِبُهَا، حَتَّى إِذَا مَلَ قَالَ: إِنِّي أَعْذُرُ إِلَيْكُمْ، إِنِّي لَمْ أَتُرْكُ إِلَّا مَلَّةً، فَتَقُولُ: كَذَلِكَ فَعَلَ اللَّهُ بِكُمْ، فَابْتَاعُهَا أَبُو بَكْرٍ فَأَعْتَقَهَا.

Ibn Al-Hisham:

(Aboo Bakr) saw that **Umar Ibn Al-Khattab was torturing a slave-girl of Bani Mo'ammal from the family of Adeeb ibn Ka'b to force her to leave the religion of Islam, and Umar at that time was a polytheist (Mushrik). He hit her until he was tired, then he said: "I apologise to you that I had to stop hitting you, that is only because I got tired" whereupon she said, "Allah (swt) will do the same to you!" And then Aboo Bakr bought her and freed her.⁷**

Evidence 02:

⁷ [Saheeh Al-Sirah. Pg117.](#)

بنت عمرو بن مؤمل . أسلمت بمكة قديما ، وكانت ممن يعذب في الله . وكان عمر بن الخطاب قبل أن يسلم هو الذي يعذبها ليردها عن الإسلام فيعذبها حتى يفتر ، ثم يدعها ويقول : والله ما أدعك إلا سامة . فتقول : كذلك يفعل بك ربك

Muhammad Ibn Sa'd:

The slave-girl Bint Amr Ibn Mo'ammal, one of the early converts to Islam in Makkah was tortured in the way of Allah (swt). **And Umar Ibn Al-Khattab before his conversion was the one who tortured her to force her to leave Islam, so he hit her until he got tired, and said to her: "By God, I did not stop hitting you unless I got tired!" Whereupon she said: "Your God will do the same to you!"**⁸

Evidence 03:

وأخرج ابن المنذر عن عون بن أبي شداد قال : كانت لعمر بن الخطاب أمّة أسلّمت قبله - يقال لها : زنيرة) - فكان عمر يضرّبها على إسلامها ، وكان كفار قريش يقولون : لو كان خيرا ما سبقتنا إليه زنيرة) . فأنزل الله في شأنها : وَقَالَ الَّذِينَ كَفَرُوا لِلَّذِينَ ءَامَنُوا لَوْ كَانَ خَيْرًا الْآيَة .

Al-Suyuti:

Narrated Ibn Al-Monqir from Awn Ibn Abi Shaddad who said: **Umar had a slave-girl who embraced Islam before him. She was called Zennaira. Because of her conversion to Islam Umar used to hit her**, and the disbelievers of Quraysh used to say: If Islam was a good thing, Zennaira would not have preceded us in it, whereupon Allah (swt) revealed a verse in the Qur'aan: {And those who disbelieve say of those who believe: 'Had it (Islam) been a good thing, they (the weak and poor) would not have preceded us thereto!'}[46:11]⁹

More similar evidences:

[Al-Kamil Fi Tarikh, Vol1, Pg591](#)

[Ansab Al-Ashraaf of Al-Baladari, Vol1, Pg195](#)

[Al-Bidaya Wa'l Nihaya, Vol. 4, Pg145](#)

You who proudly boast, *'If there was any prophet after Muhammad, it would have been 'Umar'*—look at your 'Umar! While 'Isa (عليه السلام), still an infant in the cradle, spoke words of truth and defended the dignity of his mother, your so-called hero was lashing and torturing defenseless slave women. What a contrast between a divine protector of honor and a man who trampled it! This is the figure you hold as your ideal?

⁸ [Al-Tabaqat Al-Kabir, Vol10, Pg 244](#)

⁹ [Tafsir Durr Al-Mansoor, Vol13, Pg322](#)

Chapter Five: Prophet Dāwūd(ؑ) was the Giant-Slayer —‘Umar was the Battle-Fleer

(فَهَزَّهُمْ بِإِذْنِ اللَّهِ وَقَتَلَ دَاوُودَ جَالُوتَ وَآتَاهُ اللَّهُ الْمُلْكَ وَالْحِكْمَةَ وَعَلِمَهُ مِمَّا يَشَاءُ)

"So they defeated them by permission of Allah, and Dawud killed Jalut, and Allah granted him kingship and wisdom and taught him whatever He willed." (Qur'an 2:251)

From the battlefield of history shines the unshakable bravery of Dawud (ع) — a young man who stood fearlessly before the towering giant, Goliath(jalut), while entire armies trembled. With nothing but faith in Allah and a sling in his hand, Dawud struck down arrogance itself, becoming a symbol of valor, leadership, and divine favor. But on the other side of history, we find Umar ibn khattab — a man who fled from the battlefield not once, not twice, but repeatedly, abandoning the Messenger of Allah (عليه وسلم) and his companions at the moments when courage was most needed. While Dawud earned kingship and wisdom from Allah through his bravery, Umar earned shame in the pages of history through cowardice and desertion.

Evidence 01:

حدثنا أبو هشام الرفاعي ، قال : ثنا أبو بكر بن عيashi ، قال : ثنا عاصم بن كلبي ، عن أبيه ، قال : خطب عمر يوم الجمعة ، فقرأ (آل عمران) ، وكان يعجبه إذا خطب أن يقرأها ، فلما انتهى إلى قوله : (إِنَّ الَّذِينَ تَوَلَّوْا مِنْكُمْ يَوْمَ التَّقْوَى الْجَمَعَانِ) . قال : لما كان يوم أحد هزمواهم ، فقررت حتى صعدت / الجبل ، فلقد رأيتني أنزو كأني أروى ، والناس يقولون : قبل محمد ، فقلت : لا أحد أحدا يقول : قبل محمد . إلا " قتلتة ، حتى اجتمعنا على الجبل ، فنزلت : (إِنَّ الَّذِينَ تَوَلَّوْا مِنْكُمْ يَوْمَ التَّقْوَى الْجَمَعَانِ) الآية كلها .

Tabari:

Narrated Aboo Hisham Al-Rafi from Aboo Bakr Ibn Ayyash from Hasim Ibn Kulayb from his father who said: **"Umar preached on the day of Friday** and recited Surah Aal-Imraan and liked it when he reached {Those of you who turned back on the day the two hosts met}[3:155] he said: **'In the day of Uhud when we ran away, so I ran away and climbed the mountain, and I saw myself running and jumping like a mountain goat.** And the people were saying: Muhammad is killed! I said: anyone who says Muhammad is killed I will kill him! Until we gathered on the mountain and the verse {Those of you who turned back on the day the two hosts met} was revealed in complete.¹⁰

Rijal analysis:

Abu Hisham al-Rafī- **Thiqah** ([according to al-khatib al baghdadi and al-barqarni](#))

Abu Bakr ibn Ayyāsh- **Thiqah** ([according to al-dahabi and ahmad ibn hanbal](#))

Hāshim ibn Kulayb- **Strong Thiqah** ([according to Al-Mizzī](#))

¹⁰ [Tafsir Jami Al-Bayan, Vol6, Pg172](#)

Kulayb ibn Shahāb- **Thiqah (according to Ibn Sa'd)**

Note: Bukhari had deemed Aboo Hisham Al-Rafai as being weak. But this narration has also been narrated through other chains

٩٧٥ - حَدَّثَنَا مُحَمَّدُ بْنُ إِسْمَاعِيلَ الصَّانِعُ، قَالَ: حَدَّثَنَا يَحْيَى بْنُ عَبْدِ الْحَمِيدِ، قَالَ: حَدَّثَنَا أَبُو بَكْرُ، عَنْ عَاصِمٍ بْنِ كَلِيبٍ، عَنْ أَبِيهِ، قَالَ: خَطَبَنَا عُمَرٌ، وَعَلَيْهِ قَطْرِيٌّ أَوْ ثُوبٌ أَبْيَضٌ، فِيهِ رَفْعَةٌ، إِذَا رَأَيْتَهَا كَانَهَا مِنَ الْأَدْمِ، فَخَطَبَنَا فَكَانَ يَقْرَأُ عَلَى الْمِنْبَرِ "آلُ عُمَرَانَ" وَيَقُولُ: إِنَّهَا أُحْدِيَّةٌ، ثُمَّ قَالَ: / تَفَرَّقْنَا عَنْ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ يَوْمَ أُحْدِيٍّ فَصَعَدْنَا الْجَبَلَ، فَسَمِعْتُ يَهُودِيًّا يَقُولُ: قُتِلَ مُحَمَّدٌ، فَقَلَّتْ: لَا أَسْمَعُ أَحَدًا يَقُولُ: قُتِلَ مُحَمَّدٌ إِلَّا ضَرَبَتْ عَنْقَهِ، فَنَظَرْتُ إِذَا رَسُولُ اللَّهِ، وَالنَّاسُ يَتَرَاجِعُونَ إِلَيْهِ، فَنَزَّلَتْ هَذِهِ الْآيَةُ: وَمَا مُحَمَّدٌ إِلَّا رَسُولٌ قَدْ خَلَّتْ مِنْ قَبْلِهِ الرُّسُلُ .

Ibn Munzir:

Narrated Muhammad ibn Ismaeel Al-Sahigh from Yahya Ibn Abdulhamid from Aboo Bakr (Ibn Ayyash) from Hasim ibn Kulayb from his father who said: Umar gave a sermon, he was wearing a white cloth with a patch on it. It looked bright, he was preaching on the pulpit and reciting Surah Aal Imraan. He said that this Surah was revealed in Uhud. Then said: **we left the Messenger of Allah (swt) in the day of Uhud and I climbed the mountain**, and I heard a Jew calling: 'Muhammad is killed, I said: 'Anyone who says Muhammad is killed I will chop his head!' Then I looked and saw the Messenger of Allah (swt) in the battlefield and saw that people are returning to him. Then this verse was revealed: {Muhammad is no more than a Messenger: many were the Messengers that passed away before Him. If he died or was slain, will ye then turn back on your heels?}[3:144].¹¹

Evidence 02:

روى ابن المنذر عن كليب بن شهاب قال : خطبنا عمر فكان يقرأ على المنبر آل عمران ويقول : إنها أحديه) فلما انتهى إلى قوله تعالى : (إِنَّ الَّذِينَ تَوَلَّوْا مِنْكُمْ يوْمَ التَّقْوَى الْجَمِيعَانَ)) قال : لما كان يوم أحد هزمنا ونفرت ، حتى صعدت في الجبل ، فقد رأيتني أتزو كأني أروي ، فسمت يهوديا يقول : قبل محمد ، فقلت : لا أسمع أحدا يقول : قتيل محمد إلا ضربت عنقه ، فنظرت فإذا رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم والناس يتراجعون إليه

Al-Salehi Al-Shammi:

Narrated Ibn Al-Munzir Kulayb Ibn Shahab who said: Umar preached on the day of Friday and recited Surah Aallmraan and said: It was revealed in Uhud, when he reached {Those of you who turned back on the day the two hosts met}[3:155] he said:

¹¹ [Tafsir Ibn Munzir, Vol1, Pg402](#)

On the day of Uhud we ran away, **so I ran away and climbed the mountain, and I saw myself running and jumping like a mountain goat.** And I heard a jew saying: 'Muhammad is killed, I said: 'Anyone who says Muhammad is killed I will chop his head! Then I looked and saw the Messenger of Allah (swt) in the battlefield and saw that people are returning to him.'¹²

[Umar in battle of khandaq]

Evidence 03:

اَخْبَرَنَا عُمَرَ بْنُ مُوسَى بْنِ مَاجَمِعٍ، حَدَّثَنَا عُثْمَانَ بْنَ أَبِي شَيْبَةَ، حَدَّثَنَا يَزِيدَ بْنَ هَارُونَ، أَخْبَرَنَا مُحَمَّدٌ بْنُ عُمَرَ، عَنْ أَبِيهِ، عَنْ جَدِّهِ

عَنْ عَائِشَةَ قَالَتْ : خَرَجَتِ يَوْمَ الْخَنْدَقِ أَقْفَوْتُ أَثْرَ النَّاسِ ، فَسَمِعْتُ وَلِيدَ الْأَرْضَ مِنْ وَرَائِي ، فَالْتَّفَتْ فَإِذَا أَنَا بِسَعْدِ بْنِ مَعَاذٍ وَقَعَهُ أَبْنَ أَخِيهِ الْحَارِثِ بْنِ أَوْسٍ (٣) يَحْمِلُ مَجْلَهُ ، فَجَلَسْتُ إِلَى الْأَرْضِ ، فَمَرَ سَعْدٌ وَعَلَيْهِ دَرْعٌ قَدْ خَرَجَتِ مِنْهَا أَطْرَافُهُ ، فَأَنَا (اَتَخُوفُ عَلَى أَطْرَافِ سَعْدٍ ، وَكَانَ مِنْ أَعْظَمِ النَّاسِ وَأَطْوَلِهِمْ)

قَالَتْ : قَمَرٌ وَهُوَ يَرْتَجِزُ وَيَقُولُ

لَبِيتْ قَلِيلًا يُدْرِكُ الْهَيْجَا حَمْل

مَا أَحَسَنَ الْمَوْتَ إِذَا حَانَ الْأَجَلِ

قَالَتْ : فَقَمْتُ فَاقْتَحَمْتُ حَدِيقَةً ، فَإِذَا نَفَرَ مِنَ الْمُسْلِمِينَ ، فِيهِمْ عُمَرُ بْنُ الْخَطَّابِ رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ ، فَقَالَ عُمَرُ : وَيَحْكُ ، مَا جَاءَ بِكَ ، الْعُمْرِيُّ وَاللَّهُ إِنَّكَ الْجَرِيَّةُ ، مَا يُؤْمِنُكَ أَنْ يَكُونَ تَحْوِزَ (٢) أَوْ بَلَاءً ، قَالَتْ : فَمَا زَالَ يَلْوَمِنِي حَتَّى تَمَنَّيْتُ أَنَّ الْأَرْضَ قَدْ اَنْشَقَتْ ، فَدَخَلْتُ فِيهَا ، وَفِيهِمْ رَجُلٌ عَلَيْهِ نَصِيفَةٌ لَهُ ، فَرَفَعَ الرَّجُلُ النَّصِيفَ عَنْ وَجْهِهِ ، فَإِذَا طَلْحَةُ بْنُ عَبْدِ اللَّهِ ، فَقَالَ : وَيَحْكُ يَا عُمَرَ ، إِنَّكَ قَدْ أَكْثَرْتَ مِنْ

الْيَوْمِ ، وَأَيْنَ الْقَرَارُ إِلَّا إِلَى اللَّهِ؟

Ibn Hibban:

Narrated Imran Ibn Musa Ibn Moshajeh from Uthman Ibn Abi Shayba from Yazeed Ibn Har'oon from Muhammad Ibn Amr from his father from his grandfather from **A'isha who said: "I went out in the day of Al-Khandaq and I was standing behind the people,**

¹² [Sobul Al-Hoda wa Al-Rashad. Vol4. Pg305](#)

then I heard sounds of ground coming from behind me, I turned around and saw Sa'd Ibn Ma'az and his nephew Al-Harith Ibn Aws was carrying his armour, so I sat down on the ground and Sa'd passed by and he was wearing an armour that its outskirts were gone out of his limbs. I was afraid of his armours outskirts, and Sa'd was of the biggest and tallest people, she said: Sa'd passed by singing epic verses: 'Very soon the battle of the brave man begins.. what a good thing it is that the death comes'" She (A'isha) said: Then I entered a garden, and I saw that a group of people who had been (hiding) there, among them was Umar Ibn AlKhattab, Umar said: 'Woe to you, what brought you here?! By God you are a bold woman, what made you think that you are safe of getting captured or get into trouble!' She (A'isha) said: 'He kept blaming me so much until I wished that the earth splits so that I enter into it.' Among them there was another man who was covering his face, then the man took the cover away, he was Talha Ibn Ubaidallah, so he said: 'Woe to you Umar! You said too much today, where is the place to escape or flee except towards Allah?'

Footnote: The Hadeeth is Hasan 'Reliable.'¹³

[Umar in battle of khaybar]

Evidence 04:

٤٤٤٤ - أخبرنا أبو العباس محمد بن أحمد المحبوبى بمرو، ثنا سعيد بن مسعود، ثنا عبد الله بن موسى، ثنا نعيم بن حكيم، عن أبي موسى الحنفى، عن علي رضي الله عنه قال : سار النبي ﷺ إلى خير فلما أتتها بعث عمر رضي الله تعالى عنه وبعث معه الناس إلى مدینتهم أو قصرهم فقاتلوهم فلم يلبيوا أن هزموا عمر وأصحابه فجاءوا يجبنونه ويجبتهم فسار النبي ، الحديث / . هذا حديث صحيح الإسناد ولم يخرجاه

Al-Hakim With The Attestation Of Al-Dhahabi:

Narrated Abul Abbas Muhammad ibn Ahmad Al-Mahboobi in Marw, from Sa'eed Ibn Masoud from Ubaidallah Ibn Musa from No'aim Ibn Hakim from Abi Musa Al-Hanafi from Alee (a.s) who said: 'The Messenger of Allah (saw) went out to Khaybar, when he reached it he sent Umar and a group of people with him to their town or their castle to fight them, but they could not do anything, and Umar with his companions escaped and came back to the Prophet(saw), his companions were

¹³ [Saheeh Ibn Hibban, Vol15, Pg498 - 501](#)

saying that Umar is a coward and he was saying that his companions are cowards and then the Prophet (saw) said that famous Hadeeth.(*)¹⁴

Al-Hakim: The chain of this narration is authentic, but they (i.e. Bukhari and Muslim) have not narrated it.

(*) It is known as The Hadeeth of Flag.

Footnote: Al-Dhahabi says in Al-Talkhees: It is Saheeh 'Authentic.'

[Umar in battle of Hunayn]

Evidence 05:

* **وقال الليث حديثي يحيى بن سعيد عن عمر بن كثير بن أفلح عن أبي محمد مولى أبي قتادة أن أبا قتادة قال : لما كان يوم حنين نظرت إلى رجل من المسلمين يقاتل رجلاً من المشركين ، وآخر من المشركين يختله من ورائه ليقتلته ، فأسرعت إلى الذي يختله فرفع يده ليضربني ، وأضرب يده فقطعتها ، ثم أخذني فضماني ضمًا شديداً حتى تخوفت . ثم برّك فتحلل ، ودفعته ثم قتلتة ، وانهزم المسلمون وانهزمت معهم ، فإذا بعمر بن الخطاب في الناس ، فقلت له : ما شأن الناس ؟ فقال : أمر الله . ثم تراجع الناس إلى رسول الله عليه وسلم ، فقال رسول الله عليه وسلم : من أقام بيضة على قتيل قتله فله سلبها ، فقمت لأتتيس بيضة على قتيلي . فلم أر أحداً يشهد لي ، فجلست ، ثم بدا لي فذكرت أمره الرسول عليه وسلم ، فقال رجل من جلساته : سلاح هذا القتيل الذي يذكر عندي ، فأرضه منه . فقال أبو أبو بكر : كلا ، لا يعطيه أصبع من قريش ، ويدع أسدًا من أسد الله يقاتل عن الله ورسوله . قال : فقام رسول الله عليه وسلم فأدأه إلى ، فاشترى منه خرافاً ، فكان أول مال تأثثت في الإسلام .**

Al-Bukhari:

Narrated Al-Laith from Yahya Ibn Sa'eed from Umar Ib Kathir Ibn Aflah from Abi Muhammad Mawla Abi Qotada that Aba Qotada said: **'When it was the day of (the battle of) Hunayn, I saw a Muslim man fighting with one of the pagans and another pagan was hiding himself behind the Muslim in order to kill him. So I hurried towards the pagan who was hiding behind the Muslim to kill him, and He raised his hand to hit me but I hit his hand and cut it off. That man got hold of me and pressed me so hard that I was afraid (that I would die), then He knelt down and his grip became loose and I pushed him and killed him. The Muslims started**

¹⁴ Al-Mustadrak Ala Al-Sahihain. Vol3. Pg40

fleeing and I too, fled with them. Suddenly I met Umar bin Al-Khattab amongst the people and I asked him, "What is wrong with the people?" He said, "It is the order of Allah." Then the people returned to Allah's Apostle (after defeating the enemy). Allah's Apostle said, "Whoever produces a proof that he has killed an infidel, will have the spoils of the killed man." So I got up to look for an evidence to prove that I had killed an infidel, but I could not find anyone to bear witness for me, so I sat down. Then it came to my mind (that I should speak of it) and I mentioned the case to Allah's Apostle. A man from the persons who were sitting with him (i.e. the Prophet), said, "The arms of the deceased one whom He (i.e. Aboo Qatada) has mentioned, are with me, so please compensate him for it (i.e. the spoils)." Aboo Bakr said, "No, Allah's Apostle will not give it (i.e. the spoils) to a weak humble person from Quraish and leave one of Allah's Lions who fights on behalf of Allah and His Apostle." Allah's Apostle then got up and gave that (spoils) to me, and I bought with it, a garden which was the first property I got after embracing Islam.¹⁵

¹⁵ [Saheeh Al-Bukhari. Pg1056 - 1057](#)

Chapter Six: The Prophet Muhammad(saws) Never Raised His Hand on his wives — Umar use to beat his wife

The Messenger of Allah ﷺ was the embodiment of mercy at home, never once raising his blessed hand against his wives. He treated them with tenderness, patience, and honor, as commanded by Allah: ‘*And live with them in kindness*’ (Qur’ān 4:19). Yet, what a shameful contrast lies in ‘Umar — a man who not only confessed to striking his wife but boasted of it! Where the Prophet ﷺ melted hearts with gentleness, ‘Umar hardened hearts with violence. Where the Prophet ﷺ protected women as a trust from Allah, ‘Umar reduced them to objects of his anger.

Evidence 01:

١٠٣/٧٣٤٢ - حدثنا محمد بن صالح بن هانى، ثنا الحسين بن الفضل البجلي، ثنا سليمان بن حرب، ثنا أبو عوانة، ثنا داود بن عبد الله الأودي، عن عبد الرحمن بن عبد الله المكي، عن الأشعث بن قيس قال : تضييف عمر بن الخطاب رضي الله عنه فقام في بعض الليل فتناول امرأته فضربها ثم ناداني : يا أشعث، قلت: ليك . قال : احفظ عنى ثلاثة حفظتهن، عن رسول الله ﷺ : لا تسأل الرجل فيما يضرب امرأته ولا تسأله عنمن يعتمد من إخوانه ولا يعتمد هم ولا تتم إلا على وتر / هذا حديث صحيح الإسناد ولم يخرجاه

Hakim Al-Nishaburi:

It was narrated that Ash'ath bin Qais said: "**I was a guest (at the home) of Umar one night, and in the middle of the night he went and hit his wife**, then he called me and said to me: 'O Ash'ath, learn from me something that I heard from the Messenger of Allah (swt) saying, "A man should not be asked why he beats his wife, and ask not which one of his brother he trusts or does not trust and do not go to sleep until you have prayed the Witr." Footnote: Al-Hakim: The chain is Saheeh 'Authentic' but they (Bukhari and Muslim) have not narrated it. ¹⁶

Al-Dhahabi: It is Saheeh 'Authentic.'

¹⁶ Al-Mustadrak ala Al-Sahihain, Vol 4, Pg 194, H103/7342.

Conclusion:

After all this, the truth cannot be denied. ***From Adam to Nūh, from Ibrāhīm to Mūsā, from Dāwūd to Īsā, every Prophet of Allah (عليهم السلام) was a fountain of mercy, justice, patience, and divine guidance. Their legacy was sacrifice for Allah's sake, not selfishness, cruelty, or tyranny.***

And then we are told...shamelessly, foolishly....that the Messenger of Allah ﷺ supposedly said: ***"If there were to be a Prophet after me, it would have been 'Umar."*** What a laughable claim! What an insult to Prophethood itself!

How can anyone even utter such a statement when the Prophet ﷺ was the **embodiment of mercy** while 'Umar raised his hand on women? When the Prophet ﷺ lifted humanity with compassion, while 'Umar buried his daughter in the sands of ignorance? When the Prophet ﷺ never fled from the battlefield, while 'Umar is remembered for running away at Hunayn and Khaybar? When the Prophet ﷺ carried the Qur'ān in his chest, while 'Umar carried arrogance in his heart?

To compare the two is not only false — it is blasphemy against the very definition of Prophethood. Prophets are chosen, purified, guided by Allah Himself. 'Umar was none of these. He was a man of anger, a man of brutality, a man of fear.

Therefore, let it be thundered loud and clear:

The Prophet ﷺ could never — and would never — make such a claim. To attribute it to him is a fabrication, a distortion, and an insult to the Seal of Prophethood itself.

'Umar was not a Prophet, nor anything like one. He was a man who trembled at nothingness, who raised his hand where mercy was needed, who fled when courage was demanded. To put his name in the same breath as Prophethood is to trample upon the sanctity of revelation.

The Prophet ﷺ is the **Final Prophet** — the one who closed the gates of revelation. And after him, no one can ever claim that station. Especially not a man like 'Umar.

This is where we stand. This is where we end. No false narration, no twisted report, no fabricated praise will ever blind us. The Prophets of Allah were chosen by Him — and 'Umar was not.